

## Message

---

**From:** Caldwell, Jane [Caldwell.Jane@epa.gov]  
**Sent:** 7/18/2013 4:49:41 PM  
**To:** Guyton, Kate [Guyton.Kate@epa.gov]  
**CC:** Subramaniam, Ravi [Subramaniam.Ravi@epa.gov]; Chiu, Weihsueh [Chiu.Weihsueh@epa.gov]; Glenn, Barbara [Glenn.Barbara@epa.gov]; Kraft, Andrew [Kraft.Andrew@epa.gov]  
**Subject:** RE: ToxPathways group-- preliminary review comments  
**Attachments:** points to consider formaldehyde assessment 071813.docx

Dear Kate,

I was on Furlough yesterday afternoon. I have done the best I can to comply with your request. I will be in a 3-hour meeting this afternoon regarding the peer review handbook. This is all the time I can spare. See the attachment.

Jane Caldwell

---

**From:** Guyton, Kate  
**Sent:** Wednesday, July 17, 2013 3:40 PM  
**To:** Caldwell, Jane  
**Cc:** Subramaniam, Ravi; Chiu, Weihsueh; Glenn, Barbara; Kraft, Andrew  
**Subject:** RE: ToxPathways group-- preliminary review comments

Dear Jane,

I've reviewed the comments and find them very valuable. Thank you for providing them. However, it would be useful for our workgroup to be able to review these in outline form, as was requested in my email of 7/2. Specifically, that request was:

- **Lead reviewers (Jason F, Jane, Janice)** will send to me next week a bulleted list/outline covering up to 3-4 "key" review topics for each of the four review questions. The objective at this stage is to identify key issues for more focused effort. I will circulate to the team for comment, and we will have a group discussion of these late next week.

The reason for this request was to allow the group as a whole to provide feedback on the topics and scope, to aid in understanding potential areas of agreement/disagreement among the group. Ultimately we aim to provide a consensus workgroup product rather than individual reviewer comments that the assessment team would then need to reconcile.

Also, given the limited time for this effort that you very correctly note, it is essential for best informing how to focus your time in generating review comments AND the team's time in revising the assessment.

# Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

I am happy to forward the other comments to the assessment team as an FYI.

I append the latest draft of Jason's comment on the other cancer MOA section for reference.

Thanks again Jane for your thoughtful comments and contributions to the team.

Best regards,

Kate

---

**Kate Z. Guyton, PhD DABT**

Office of Research & Development, US EPA

703-347-8562 | [guyton.kate@epa.gov](mailto:guyton.kate@epa.gov)

Mailing Address: US EPA (8623-P), 1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC 20460

FedEx and Ground Deliveries: Two Potomac Yard (North Building), 2733 S. Crystal Drive, Arlington VA 22202

---

**From:** Caldwell, Jane

**Sent:** Tuesday, July 16, 2013 6:40 PM

**To:** Guyton, Kate; Glenn, Barbara; Kraft, Andrew; Segal, Deborah; Adams, Lynn; Chiu, Arthur; Chiu, Weihsueh; Fritz, Jason; Gibbons, Catherine; Gwinn, Maureen; Keshava, Channa; Keshava, Nagalakshmi; Lambert, Jason; Lee, Janice; Petersen, Dan; Pratt, Margaret; Subramaniam, Ravi; Vulimiri, Suryanarayana

**Cc:** Sonawane, Bob; Cogliano, Vincent

**Subject:** RE: ToxPathways group-- preliminary review comments

Dear Kate and rest of group,

As I mentioned last week, I have reviewed the formaldehyde assessment as a "peer reviewer" as well as giving comments on my initial assignment. I have more general comments and specific ones written as a memo for the TPW and formaldehyde authors to consider. I attach them below.

Jane Caldwell

---

**From:** Guyton, Kate

**Sent:** Thursday, July 11, 2013 4:28 PM

**To:** Glenn, Barbara; Kraft, Andrew; Segal, Deborah; Adams, Lynn; Caldwell, Jane; Chiu, Arthur; Chiu, Weihsueh; Fritz, Jason; Gibbons, Catherine; Gwinn, Maureen; Keshava, Channa; Keshava, Nagalakshmi; Lambert, Jason; Lee, Janice; Petersen, Dan; Pratt, Margaret; Subramaniam, Ravi; Vulimiri, Suryanarayana

**Cc:** Sonawane, Bob; Cogliano, Vincent

**Subject:** ToxPathways group-- preliminary review comments

Hi all,

First, a very hearty thanks to our lead reviewers— Jason F, Jane, and Janice—who all did an excellent job reviewing the formaldehyde MOA sections! I also thank everyone who participated in the very cordial discussion today—the lead reviewer "J's", plus Jason L, Dan, Nagu, Catherine, Arthur, and Margaret. We also really appreciated having the participation of Barbara, Andrew and Deborah. We thank them for being very open to our input and for the valuable insights they provided. And.. thanks to Vince for joining too! ☺

I'm appending here the bulleted comments from Jason and Janice; Jane has stated that she concurs with these. I will forward any additional written comments from Jane as soon as available. Below I have provided a few bullets from my notes at the meeting; workgroup members, please add/edit.

**Formaldehyde team:** we thought it prudent to share these comments as soon as possible (considering your very tight timeline for completing the assessment). We would like your input on what may be the most helpful regarding our next steps, which may include:

- We can provide additional detail on the review comments (e.g., in the Word documents or by adding comment bubbles).
- We can work with your team to help implement some of the critical aspects of our suggestions.
- We can review further revisions.
- Anything else, do let us know.

Any questions, don't hesitate to ask. I'm here tomorrow (and beyond...) if you'd like to discuss.

Thanks again,

Kate

-----  
**Kate Z. Guyton, PhD DABT**

Office of Research & Development, US EPA

703-347-8562 | [guyton.kate@epa.gov](mailto:guyton.kate@epa.gov)

Mailing Address: US EPA (8623-P), 1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC 20460

FedEx and Ground Deliveries: Two Potomac Yard (North Building), 2733 S. Crystal Drive, Arlington VA 22202

Kate's notes from the discussion:

## Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)